

The Scots see him as a great philanthropist, but Pittsburgh still cannot forgive Carnegie

By **Iain Lundy**

IN his home country he is hailed as one of the greatest Scotsmen who ever lived.

Andrew Carnegie is remembered as the rags-to-riches industrialist who became the world's wealthiest man – then gave away his vast fortune.

But in the US city where the steel magnate made much of his money, the name Carnegie remains so reviled that no statue of him has ever been erected.

As Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, prepares to honour its favourite son Gene Kelly in effigy, the suggestion that the Scottish philanthropist might be worth a statue was given short shrift by the city's leading citizen.

Mayor Tom Murphy said he 'did not feel it appropriate for him to comment on the various opinions that exist in Pittsburgh regarding Mr Carnegie.'

Mr Murphy, whose father worked for decades in the city's steel mills, added: 'There are no plans in the works at this time for any type of statue, nor has anyone ever approached me with a proposal to construct one.'

Carnegie transformed Pittsburgh into one of the greatest industrial centres in the US before selling his business interests there for \$480 million – an incredible fortune in those days – and becoming the richest man on the globe.

But his image in Pittsburgh contrasts sharply with that in Scotland, where his statue stands in his home town of Dunfermline and the Carnegie United Kingdom Trust website describes him as 'the man of steel with a heart of gold'.

The incident that turned many Pittsburghers against Carnegie was his reaction to a strike at his Homestead steel plant in 1892.

Carnegie, then on holiday in Scotland, instructed his deeply unpopu-

lar general manager Henry Clay Frick to shut down the plant.

Frick called in Pinkerton's Detective Agency to break the dispute, and trouble flared when boatloads of Pinkerton's men sailed up the Monongahela River armed with Winchester rifles.

In the shootout that followed, three detectives and nine members of the Amalgamated Association of Iron and Steel Workers lay dead.

Local historian Ron Baraff said: 'In Scotland you never experienced the industrial end of things – you got Carnegie on vacation. He is not viewed favourably here.'

'I have a lot of respect for him as an industrialist and a capitalist, but

he was also a huge hypocrite. He was one of the greatest self-promoters ever.

'If you look around the Pittsburgh area you notice that Carnegie's philanthropy picked up greatly after the 1892 strike.

'There is a school of thought in the city that, by doing this, Carnegie was trying to buy back his soul.

'There are a great many people – and it sounds like this is the case in Scotland – whose only experience of Carnegie is through his philanthropic endeavours.

'But there is a lot more to him in Pittsburgh. He is respected in some quarters, but not revered.

'You will get a lot of people in this

The man of steel... with a cold heart to match

POWERFUL FIGURE:
Carnegie gave away millions, but how did he make them?

city who have nothing nice to say about him. I think any plan to build a public statue of Carnegie would spark a huge and amazing debate in Pittsburgh.

'My feeling is that, if a statue of him was ever built, we would also have to have a statue dedicated to the steel workers.'

Elizabeth East, of the Carnegie

UK Trust in Dunfermline, said: 'We tend to look on the positive side of Carnegie's life.'

'The money he left, which was seven-eighths of his fortune, has been used to great effect and has been of great influence.'

'A lot of great philanthropists were very strong and controversial in the ways they made their money.'

